



Military Review

Lieutenant General David H. Petraeus

Commander,
USACAC
Commandant, CGSC

Colonel
William M. Darley
Editor in Chief

Staff

Lieutenant Colonel
Arthur E. Bilodeau
Managing Editor

Sandra Caballero
Managing Editor,
Latin American Editions

Major Thomas Shrader
Marketing and Production
Manager

Marlys Cook
Supervisory Editor

John Garabedian
Associate Editor

Nancy Mazzia
Books and Features Editor

Barbara Baeuchle
Visual Information Specialist

Patricia L. Wilson
Administrative Assistant

Michael Serravo
Visual Information Specialist
Webmaster

Editorial Board Members

Brigadier General Mark E. O'Neill
Deputy Commandant, CGSC

Clinton J. Ancker III, Director,
Combined Arms Doctrine Directorate

Robert Baumann, Director,
CGSC Graduate Program

COL Kevin Benson, Director,
School of Advanced Military Studies

Gregory Fontenot, Director,
University of Foreign Military and
Cultural Studies

Lester W. Grau
Foreign Military Studies Office
William G. Robertson, Deputy
Director, Combat Studies Institute

Lon R. Seglie, Chief,
Publication Division
Center for Army Lessons Learned

Dennis Tighe, Deputy Director,
Combined Arms Center-Training

COL Stuart Whitehead, Director,
TPIO Battle Command

Consulting Editors

Colonel Franklberg
Ribeiro de Freitas
Brazilian Army,
Brazilian Edition

Lieutenant Colonel
Motriz Traub Bauer
Chilean Army,
Hispano-American Edition

Dhia Hakim
Arabic Edition

Cover Photo: BAGHDAD, Iraq—Army Colonel James H. Coffman Jr., after receiving the Distinguished Service Cross, 24 August 2005, for combat actions in support of the 3rd Battalion, 1st Iraqi Special Police Commando Brigade on 14 November 2004, during a five-and-a-half hour battle with terrorists trying to overrun an Iraqi police station in Mosul. When an enemy round severely wounded his shooting hand and damaged his M4 rifle, Coffman bandaged himself and continued fighting with AK-47s he collected from commando casualties. Coffman refused evacuation for treatment until the battle was over. In remarks during the award ceremony, Coffman praised the Iraqi Commandos for their service and commitment to defending freedom in Iraq. He said he viewed the ceremony as a tribute to the Iraqi and Coalition forces that have fought, bled and died together. Iraq's Minister of Interior, Bayan Jabr, and Iraqi Maj. Gen. Adnon Thebit, commander of the Special Police Forces, also each presented Coffman with Iraqi medallions. Following the ceremony, Coffman stated that he did not believe democracy could be fast-tracked in Iraq, but would take time. The United States had to work through several years of contentious issues—including a Civil War—before it enjoyed a stable democratic government, he noted. "It's easy, when you've had a couple centuries of experience with democracy, to overlook the difficulties in getting that," Coffman said. "I can't think of a nobler endeavor than to help 28 million people achieve it." (MNSTC-I Public Affairs)

FEATURED ARTICLES

2 Waiting for Godot in Iraq

F.J. Bing West

As the war in Iraq enters a period of uncertainty, a highly regarded former Assistant Secretary of Defense addresses the four biggest challenges facing our military effort.

13 Developing a National Counterinsurgency Capability for the War on Terror

John Hillen, Ph.D.

The Assistant Secretary of State for Political-Military Affairs, Dr. Hillen calls for a COIN strategic framework that incorporates all the instruments of national power.

16 Using Occam's Razor to Connect the Dots: The Ba'ath Party and the Insurgency in Tal Afar

Captain Travis Patriquin, U.S. Army

Long ago, Saddam Hussein positioned loyal Ba'athists in Tal Afar to neutralize political and ethnic enclaves, and they now support the insurgent forces in the city.

27 Commander's Assessment: South Baghdad

Lieutenant Colonel Ross A. Brown U.S. Army

A former squadron commander discusses his unit's year in Iraq and lists his 11 commandants for winning the COIN war in South Baghdad.

35 Thailand: Anatomy of a Counterinsurgency Victory

Thomas A. Marks, Ph.D.

For 30 plus years, the Thai government battled a communist insurgency. A noted COIN expert dissects why and how the government finally prevailed.

POINT/COUNTERPOINT

52 Mounted Vertical Maneuver: A Giant Leap Forward in Maneuver and Sustainment

*Brigadier General Robin P. Swan, U.S. Army, and
Lieutenant Colonel Scott R. McMichael, U.S. Army, Retired*

Arguing for Mounted Vertical Maneuver, Swan and McMichael assert that the concept will provide versatile new options that will extend the reach and power of future joint force commanders.

63 Air Mechanization: An Expensive and Fragile Concept

*Lieutenant Colonel John Gordon IV, Ph.D., U.S. Army, Retired;
Colonel David E. Johnson, Ph.D., U.S. Army, Retired; and Peter A. Wilson*

Arguing against air-mechanization, authors Gordon, Johnson, and Wilson assert that the concept disregards relevant history, depends on questionable assumptions, and would involve massive spending.



WRITING CONTEST WINNERS

74 3d Place (COIN Competition)— Counterinsurgency Intelligence in a “Long War”: The British Experience in Northern Ireland

Brian A. Jackson, Ph.D.

As the British experience in Northern Ireland has shown, the successful counterinsurgent must diverge considerably from “classical intelligence” methods.

86 4th Place (COIN Competition)— The Paradox of Logistics in Insurgencies and Counterinsurgencies

Lieutenant Colonel Marian E. Vlasak, U.S. Army

Outgunned insurgents have long been adept at turning their superior opponents’ logistical systems into liabilities. Lessons learned from China and Vietnam could help enlighten today’s COIN thinkers.

STAND ALONE

96 Breaking the Tether of Fuel

Naval Research Advisory Committee Future Fuels Study Panel

More fuel-efficient vehicles and better fuel management can significantly extend the operational reach of Army and Marine Corps units. Here’s what the Marines are doing to get there.

101 Clausewitz’s Schwerpunkt: Mistranslated from German—Misunderstood in English

Milan Vego, Ph.D.

Army leaders should reexamine the center of gravity concept and consider adopting the German Army’s *Schwerpunkt* as a campaign planning tool.

INSIGHTS

110 Dealing with the Iraqi Populace: An Arab-American Soldier’s Perspective

Sergeant Mounir Elkhamri, U.S. Army

A Middle East military analyst, combat veteran, and fluent Arabic linguist tells us what problems concern Iraqis the most and how Soldiers should respond.

Classics Revisited

Book Reviews Contemporary readings for the professional

Peter J. Schoomaker
General, United States Army
Chief of Staff

Official:

JOYCE E. MORROW
Administrative Assistant to the
Secretary of the Army 0633903

Military Review presents professional information, but the views expressed herein are those of the authors, not the Department of Defense or its elements. The content does not necessarily reflect the official U.S. Army position and does not change or supersede any information in other official U.S. Army publications. Authors are responsible for the accuracy and source documentation of material they provide. *Military Review* reserves the right to edit material. Basis of official distribution is one per 10 officers for major commands, corps, divisions, major staff agencies, garrison commands, Army schools, Reserve commands, and Cadet Command organizations; one per 25 officers for medical commands, hospitals, and units; and one per five officers for Active and Reserve brigades and battalions, based on assigned field grade officer strength. *Military Review* is available online at <http://militaryreview.army.mil>.

Military Review (US ISSN 0026-4148) (USPS 123-830) is published bimonthly by the U.S. Army, CAC, Fort Leavenworth, KS 66027-1254. Paid subscriptions are available through the Superintendent of Documents for \$42 US/APO/FPO and \$58.80 foreign addresses per year. Periodical postage paid at Leavenworth, KS, and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to Superintendent of Documents, PO Box 371954, Pittsburgh, PA 15250-7954.